

Symbiotic International Consulting Services (SICS)



Assessing Organizational and Evaluation Excellence Using Total Quality and Environmental Management Systems Approaches (Quest for Excellence)

Sandiran (Sandi) Premakanthan

Australasian Evaluation Society (AES)
Annual Conference
Perth, Australia
September 10-12, 2008

Presentation Objectives

- Provide to an introduction to Total Quality and Environmental Management Systems approaches to assessing management excellence
- Provide a comparison of the different but complimentary Value for Money (VFM)/Excellence Assessment approaches
- Provide a rationale for a total systems approach to evaluation management

Evaluation Policy Proposal

- Refocus evaluation on results and value-for-money (ie: relevance and program performance)
- Reference: Treasury Board Secretariat of Canada

Suite of Evaluation Approaches

- Strategic Policy Evaluation
- Impact Evaluation
- Targeted VFM Evaluations
- Implementation Evaluation

Value for Money Definition

- Value for money is one definition of quality that judges the quality of provision, processes or outcomes against the monetary cost of making the provision, undertaking the process or achieving the outcomes.

Value for Money Definition

- A concept associated with the economy, effectiveness and efficiency of a service, product or process, ie a comparison of the input costs against the value of the outputs and a qualitative and quantitative judgement over the manner in which the resources involved have been utilised and managed.

Value for Money Definition

- Erlendsson (2002) states:

Value for money (VFM) is a term used to assess whether or not an organisation has obtained the maximum benefit from the goods and services it both acquires and provides, within the resources available to it.

Source: *Analytic Quality Glossary*

Value for Money Audit

- Independent audit of a not-for-profit organization (government agency or unit, charity, trust, etc.) to assess the effectiveness and efficiency of its utilization of funds. It is employed where the standard commercial performance (profit oriented) measures cannot be used. Also called value for money analysis.

THE QUEST FOR EXCELLENCE

- International Organization for Standardization - ISO Suite of Systems and Standards
- ISO 9000 -2005 Quality Management System
- ISO 14000 - 2004 Environmental Management System

Evaluation Excellence Standards

- Evaluation Planning and Issues
- Competency
- Objectivity and Integrity
- Consultation and Advice
- Measurement and Analysis
- Reporting

Reference: Treasury Board Secretariat of Canada - Evaluation Policy -
April 1, 2001

THE QUEST FOR EXCELLENCE

- The Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award - Criteria for Performance Excellence Framework
- The Canadian Framework for Business Sector Excellence
- Canadian Quality Criteria for the Public Sector Excellence
- European Foundation Quality Management (EFQM) Business Excellence Model

Value for Money Tools and Techniques

- Value for Money Evaluation/Assessment Tool/Profile (Treasury Board Secretariat of Canada)
- Cost-Benefit Analysis
- Cost-Effectiveness
- Cost - Analysis
- Infrastructure Ontario: Value for Money - alternative financing and procurement (AFP) model

ISO 9000 -2005 Quality Management System Standards

ISO 9001: Systemic Requirements

- 4.1 Establish your quality management system (QMS)
- 4.2 Document your quality management system (QMS)

ISO 9001: Management Requirements

- 5.1 Support quality
- 5.2 Satisfy your customers
- 5.3 Establish a quality policy
- 5.4 Carry out quality planning
- 5.5 Control your quality system
- 5.6 Perform management reviews

ISO 9000 -2005 Quality Management System Standards

ISO 9001:Resource Requirements

- 6.1 Provide quality resources
- 6.2 Provide quality personnel
- 6.3 Provide quality infrastructure
- 6.4 Provide quality environment

ISO 14000-2004

Environmental Management System Standards

- 4.1 Systemic requirements
- 4.2 Policy requirements
- 4.3 Planning requirements
- 4.4 Operational requirements
- 4.5 Checking requirements
- 4.6 Review requirements

Baldrige Criteria for Performance Excellence Framework

A Systems Perspective



2008 Categories and Items Point Values

- **2008 Categories and Items Point Values**

- **1 Leadership** **120**
- 1.1 Senior Leadership (70)
- 1.2 Governance and Social Responsibilities (50)

- **2 Strategic Planning** **85**
- 2.1 Strategy Development (40)
- 2.2 Strategy Deployment (45)

- **3 Customer and Market Focus** **85**
- 3.1 Customer and Market Knowledge (40)
- 3.2 Customer Relationships and Satisfaction (45)

2008 Categories and Items Point Values

- **4 Measurement, Analysis, and Knowledge Management** **90**
- 4.1 Measurement, Analysis, and Improvement of Organizational Performance (45)
- 4.2 Management of Information, Information Technology, and Knowledge (45)

- **5 Workforce Focus** **85**
- 5.1 Workforce Engagement (45)
- 5.2 Workforce Environment (40)

- **6 Process Management** **85**
- 6.1 Work Systems Design (35)
- 6.2 Work Process Management and Improvement (50)

2008 Categories and Items Point Values

- **Results** **450**
- 7.1 Product and Service Outcomes (100)
- 7.2 Customer-Focused Outcomes (70)
- 7.3 Financial and Market Outcomes (70)
- 7.4 Workforce-Focused Outcomes (70)
- 7.5 Process Effectiveness Outcomes (70)
- 7.6 Leadership Outcomes (70)

- **TOTAL POINTS 1,000**

The Canadian Framework for Business Excellence



Conclusion

There is need for:

- developing and adopting a Total Evaluation Management Excellence System (EMES)
- Self-Assessments of EMES for continuous improvement
- EMES certification of evaluation organizations and auditing for compliance?

Criteria for EMES

- Evaluation Management Requirements
- Evaluation Strategic Planning Requirements
- Stakeholder/Client focus evaluation
- Evaluation workforce focus
- Evaluation process management
- Performance Results Evidence Management
(Measurement, Analysis, Monitoring and Reporting)

Contact Information

■ Sandiran (Sandi) Premakanthan

Symbiotic International Consulting Services
(SICS)

10 Lillico Drive, Ottawa, Ontario
Canada K1V 0G5.

Telephone: 613 526-0263

e-mail: symbiotic-sics@rogers.com